



GA Environment

COMMENTS AND RESPONSES REPORT FOR THE PROPOSED ENNERDALE EXT. 9 MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT, CITY OF JOHANNESBURG METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY, GAUTENG PROVINCE

MAY 2021

PREPARED BY:

GA Environment (Pty) Ltd

Address: P O Box 6723
Halfway House
Midrand
1685

Telephone: +27 11 312 2537
e-mail: environment@gaenvironment.com

SUBMITTED TO:

Gauteng Department of Rural Development and
Agriculture

Address: 56 Eloff Street
Umnotho House
Marshalltown
Johannesburg
2000

Telephone: (011) 240 3377/3051
e-mail: joshua.mahada@gauteng.gov.za

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION	3
2. COMMENTS AND RESPONSES	5
2.1 General Comments	5
2.2 Housing Beneficiaries/Typology.....	10
2.3 Engineering Services.....	12
2.4 Proposed Activities/Land uses	12
2.5 Request to Register as an Interested and Affected Party (I&AP)	13
3 SUMMARY COMMENTS AND CONCLUSION	24

1. INTRODUCTION

This Comments and Responses Report (CRR) captures the comments and issues raised by Interested and Affected Parties (I&APs) and authorities during the initial notification phase and the review of the Draft Environmental Impact Report for the proposed Ennerdale Mixed-Use Development.

The necessity for the CRR is based on Regulation 44 of the National Environmental Management Act's (NEMA) Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Regulations of 2014 (as amended). A summary of the Public Participation Process undertaken for the project to date is as follows:

The summary of the PPP that commenced in November 2019 is provided as follows:

- Meeting with the Ward Councillor and other relevant Region G personnel in November 2019 and February 2020;
- The distribution of Notification Letters from November 2019 including the distribution of hardcopies of the Notification Letters to all adjacent landowners on the 16th January 2020;
- On-site notices presenting the project were erected on site and at visible and accessible locations close to the site on the 16th of January 2020;
- An advertisement was placed on page 7 of the 28th January 2020 to 3rd February 2020 edition of the Lenasia Rising Sun Newspaper;
- It must be noted that there was a delay in the release of the Draft Scoping Reports in response to the National Lockdown regulations that were declared by the President of South Africa as a result of the outbreak of the global novel Coronavirus pandemic. On the 5th of June 2020, the minister issued directions regarding the measures to address, prevent and combat the spread of the COVID-19 relating to the National Environmental Management Permits and Licences. One of the requirements provided in the directions is that a Public Participation Plan shall be submitted to the DEFF, in instances where a case officer has been assigned to the project then the Public Participation Plan shall be submitted to the case officer. A Public Participation Plan was submitted to GDARD on the 15th of July 2020. The GDARD approved the Public Participation Plan on the 23rd of July 2020 (refer to **Appendix E1**);
- Soft copies of the Draft Scoping report were made available in November 2020. The report and its appendices could be accessed using the following link: <http://gladafrika.com/draft-scoping-report-for-the-proposed-ennerdale-mixed-use-development/>

- Hard copies of the Draft Scoping Report were made available to the City of Johannesburg Environment & Infrastructure Services Department, Ward 121 Ward Councillor, CoJ Region G Housing Department and the Ennerdale Extension 9 Community. The report was circulated for public review for the legislated 30 days. SMS', e-mail notifications and telephone calls were utilised to notify all registered I&APs about the availability of the report.

Table 1 indicates the name of the I&AP, their organisation, the date of the receipt of the comments, their communication methods well as the response of the Environmental Assessment Practitioner (EAP) to the comment. This report contains all comments that have been received to date.

2. COMMENTS AND RESPONSES

The comments and responses presented in this report are categorised according to General comments related to the project as well as requests to register as I&AP. These comments as well as their associated responses are presented in **Table 1**.

Table 1: Comments and responses for the Ennerdale Mixed-Use Development

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
NOTIFICATION PHASE (SCOPING)								
2.1 General Comments								
2.1.1	Ms.	Cilechea	Van Der Merwe	Community	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	There are already enough schools in the area.	Based on the Draft Urban Design Framework and/or Town Planning Report, it is anticipated that the development will cater for 8 000 plus residents, some of which may be new residents in the area. As such, it can be expected that these residents will include children who will require educational facilities. Therefore, the proposed addition of educational facilities

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATION METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
								will be required to ease the strain on already populated educational facilities.
2.1.2	Ms.	Munkeki	Mhlonthle	Lawley Ext. 4	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	Would it not be better to build proper houses for the Lakeview/Lawley Informal Settlement community?	The proposed project will not cover the Lakeview/Lawley Informal Settlement community, but will be limited to Erf 5445 and Erf 5446 in Ennerdale Ext.9.
2.1.3	Ms.	Sindisiwe	Chonco	Community	23 January 2020	Email	Can you please give me more information on what kind of people you are looking for?	The Notice serves to invite people to register as Interested and Affected Parties (I&APs) on the project. This is one of the requirements for the Environmental Impact Assessment for the project. I&APs will receive information from GA Environment regarding the progress of the issuing of an Environmental Authorization (i.e. permission that will be granted by the Gauteng Department of

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATION METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
								Agriculture and Rural Development for the project to proceed). Please note that authorizations are required from other relevant authorities who deal with Town Planning, water, sewage, etc. Upon receipt of all authorizations relevant to the project, the Client (Gauteng Department of Human Settlements) can begin planning for construction.
2.1.4	Ms.	Nozipho	Maduse	City of Johannesburg – Environmental Infrastructure and Services Department	27 January 2020	Email	Please deliver x1 hard and x1 soft copy of the reports to the below mentioned address for comments.	Noted
2.1.5	Ms.	Nozipho	Maduse	City of Johannesburg –	5 February 2020	Email	Please address the following in the Report:	Thank you very much for the information. We'll ensure that

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
				Environmental Infrastructure and Services Department			<p><u>Erven 5445 and 5446 Ennerdale x9</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The City’s GIS shows the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The property is owned by the CoJ and measure about 352584,45 square metres. ○ Properties are zoned Special <p>The properties are mapped as affected by the bioregional plan and are dolomitic.</p>	these are addressed in the Reports.
2.1.6	Mr.	Promise	Ngcobo	Community	10 February 2020	email	<p>I'm contacting you today, with regards to the housing project I believe is going to take place in my area Ennerdale ext 9 on Erven 5445 and 5446. I would like</p>	<p>Thank you for your interest in the project and your interest in registering as an SMME. Please find attached a notification letter providing you with further details about the project.</p>

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							to express my interest in the project as a smme in the area could you be so kind as to send me more information pertaining to this project.	Although GA Environment is not in charge of appointments, we can capture your details on our database. Do kindly indicate the services that your SMME offers, name of company so that we can capture this information. We look forward to your further involvement in the project.
2.1.7	NA/	N/A	N/A	Ennerdale Ext. 9 Community Clinic	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	Concerns over new mixed-used development that will include housing as the Ennerdale Ext.9 Community Clinic already has limited resources to cater for the existing community.	Based on the Draft Urban Design Framework and/or Town Planning Report, it is anticipated that the development will cater for 8 000 plus residents. As such, the residents will require nearby health services. Information relation to the upgrade of the Ennerdale Ext. 9 Community Clinic was not available to the EAP at the time of compilation of this DSR, hence the proposed
2.1.8	Ms.	Cilechea	Van Der Merwe	Community	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	The clinic should be expanded.	

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
								upgrade of the health facility as part of the development. Details on this matter will be discussed in the EIA Report.
2.2 Housing Beneficiaries/Typology								
2.2.1	Mr	Mxolisi	Mayana	Community	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	How will the beneficiary list work?	The selection of beneficiaries is the responsibility of the Gauteng Department of Human Settlements. GA Environment is unfortunately not involved in this process.
2.2.2	Ms.	Sindisiwe	Chonco	Community	23 January 2020	Email	Who stands to benefits on these houses (who will be the occupants)?	
2.2.3	Ms.	Tshepiso	Mthenyewo	Community	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	Will the houses be rentals or bonds?	Based on information available at the time of this DSR, Social Housing and RDP houses are proposed. Detailed information regarding the exact housing typologies were not provided to the EAP at the time of compilation of this DSR. Detailed

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATION METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
								information will be discussed in the EIA Report.
2.2.4	Ms	Lizzy	Nyaku	Lawley Ext. 4	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	How will they address the long beneficiary backlog? Since applied in 1996, still waiting for a house.	Information regarding the housing beneficiary list was not available to the EAP at the time of this DSR.
2.2.5	Mr	Jo-Risha	Brandt	Community	19 February 2020	Email	<p>I hereby send this e-mail on behalf of Mr Cornelius Trevor Visagie, in relation with the new housing development project that will be taking place in Ennerdale. He would like to register and apply for a house.</p> <p>His contact details are as follows:</p> <p>I.D no: 6203305156089</p> <p>Contact no: 0787265927</p>	Thank you for your interest in the project. The call for Interested and Affected Parties is unfortunately not for the application of the acquisition of a house but for them to become involved in the Environmental Impact Assessment Process for the project. As a registered Interested and Affected Party, you will be kept abreast of some of the developments on the project and you will be notified of the availability of Reports that will, for example, present the layout of the development

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							Name: Cornelius Trevor Visagie	<p>indicating where the housing will be located, where possible school/s, where possible commercial areas will be located, etc.</p> <p>We'll capture your details so that you are kept abreast of the availability of all the above-mentioned Reports.</p>
2.3 Engineering Services								
2.3.1	Ms.	Tshepiso	Mthenyewo	Community	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	The area already has water problems.	Based on the DOSR, the bulk water service in the area will require an upgrade. Details on this matter will be discussed in the EIA Report.
2.4 Proposed Activities/Land uses								
2.4.1	Mr.	Mxolisi	Mayana	Community	16 January 2020	Knock and	The development should include a retail centre.	Based on the Draft Outline Scheme Report (DOSR), the

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
						Drop Register		proposed development will include business areas.
2.4.2	Mr. and Mrs	Thabelo and Sibongile	Munaka	Lawley Ext. 1	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	It would be better to establish a big mall that will allow for job opportunities as houses will not overcome the unemployment in the area.	Based on the Draft Outline Scheme Report (DOSR), the proposed development will be a mixed-use development which aims to address several issues such as housing shortages and unemployment rather than neglecting one issue while addressing another.
2.4.4	Mr.	A.G	Fitzenberg	Ennerdale Community Watch, Neighbourhood Watch Sector 3	16 January 2020	Knock and Drop Register	The site was initially earmarked for business (mall), now the government is proposing housing?	Information relating to the initial land use of the site could not be verified. However, based on the DOSR, the proposed development will include business areas.
2.5 Request to Register as an Interested and Affected Party (I&AP)								
2.5.1	Mr	Collins	Jacobs	'Concern Ennerdale Residents	28 January 2020	Email	Hope you're doing well This letter is from the "Concern Ennerdale	Apologies for the late response. Thank you for your interest in the project. We have registered you as an Interested and Affected

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATION METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
				Association of Ext 9'			<p>Residents Association of Ext 9"</p> <p>Firstly we would like to express our thanks and appreciation for the housing project proposed in this area. It would go a long way in sorting out our housing crisis We also express our thanks and appreciation for the open and transparent manner in which this project has kicked off. This is how things should be done. Keep it up!</p> <p>As your Department has extended an invitation to all interested parties to participate in the process, we would like to register as one of the I&APs.</p>	<p>party on the project. We appreciate your recognition of our transparency in the process. For interest's sake, do please indicate how you were notified of the project. This is so that we as a company can obtain an indication of the best ways in which Interested and Affected Parties can be best notified of similar projects both within the ambits of legislation and where we can further supplement the legislative requirements.</p> <p>We look forward to your response and further participation on the project.</p>

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							If your Department wish to communicate with us , feel free to use this email address Your Department has our support and we wish you luck and success In this Project.	
2.5.2	Ms.	Kirsten	Manuel	Find My Quote	12 February 2020	Email	I would like to get some information with the proposed housing development that is to be happening at Ennerdale, Ext 9 on Erf no – 5445 and 5446. I work for a company that is 100% female owned and would like to know more about the project and how we can get involved as a supplier/building contractor. Kindly let me know what it is you require from us in order to be considered.	Thank you for your interest in the project. The proposed project is still in the planning phase and various studies are currently underway. It is therefore unknown when construction will commence. With regards to your interest in becoming involved as a supplier / building contractor, GA Environment is currently not handling this process. The least that we can do is to add your details on our Interested and Affected Parties database so that you receive updates on the Environmental Impact

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							In the meantime, I am attaching the company profile to perusal.	Assessment. Furthermore, we can also recommend that local businesses and personnel receive priority in the allocation of opportunities.
REVIEW OF DRAFT SCOPING REPORT								
3. Registered Interested and Affected Parties								
3.1	Ms.	Kamogelo	Motlalepula	Community member	03 November 2020	Email	Thank you for the notification of the availability of the report	Comment Noted
3.2	Mr	Collin	Jacobs	Community member	27 October 2020	Email	I just want to confirm receiving your email and want to say thanks very much. It contains a lot of information which i will have to read through to familiarise myself with the entire contents thereof.	Comment Noted

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							<p>I am going to inform the Ward Councillor to please call a Public Meeting to keep the Residents abreast of what this Project is all about. Can you also from your side please ask the Councillor to please call a Public meeting so that this project proceeds smoothly because this housing project is so essential and important, there is absolutely no place for any derailment.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comment Collin. Focus group meetings have been held with key stakeholders however the response received at notification stage did not warrant for a public meeting.</p> <p>On approval of the Final Scoping Report an EIA phase will commence whereby I&APs will be given an opportunity to participate on the project.</p>
3.3	Mr	Sthembiso	Ngcobo	Community member	27 October 2020	Email	<p>I have reviewed your report and so far I am happy with all the work you have put in, especially when it comes to the advertisement of the project.</p> <p>With that being said I still find myself wondering how</p>	<p>Your comments are noted and we look forward to your further participation on the project.</p> <p>The contribution to youths is required by GDARD and this</p>

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATION METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							<p>your company will contribute to the up lifting of youth and youth owned companies and if the youth owned businesses in Ennerdale and surrounding areas will be given first preference with regards to the broader aspects of the project. I hope moving forward more information will be presented to us.</p>	<p>information will be extracted from the development intent and presented in the draft EIA report.</p>
							<p>With the building of these house units I trust and hope that eco-friendly is the moto and that many trees and grass fields will be in cooperated to promote the reduction of greenhouse gases.</p>	<p>The need to reduce the impact on the environment has been addressed in the development intent and more details will be provided in the EIA phase.</p>
							<p>Hope this won't be an issue moving forward but knowing</p>	<p>Your comment is noted and such issues will be brought to the</p>

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							my community and the individuals in it there will be those who will pressure and try to influence the choosing subcontractors to their advantage, I believe you will be firm and resolute in your tasks from start to finish.	attention of the project managers to ensure that such matters are addressed through a Social Facilitator.
							Thank you for engaging with us we look forward to working with you to make sure this project is a success and goes off without a hitch	Your comment is noted with thanks.
3.4	Mr	Young	Nation	Community member	27 October 2020	Email	May I kindly request you to please send me the link to obtain the plans for public reviewing	Thank you for your request, an email link with plans has been forwarded.
4. City of Johannesburg Housing								
4.1	Ms.	Patricia	Nkosi	Community member	13 November	Email	No Public Came To Our Office	Your comment is noted. We will continue to encourage members of the public to review the report.

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
5. Gauteng Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (GDARD)								
5.1	Mr	Joshua	Mahada	Control Environmental Officer - Grade A: Impact Management	25 March 2021	Email	Please note that the Department accepts the Plan of Study for EIA subject to consideration and inclusion of the following, to be undertaken during the EIA process for submission to the Department	
							A Terrestrial Plant Species Impact Assessment Report/ Ecological Study in accordance with the National Environmental Management Act: Procedures for assessment and minimum criteria for reporting on identified environmental themes when applying for environmental authorisation must be submitted with the draft and final EIAR for the very high sensitivity on the relative terrestrial biodiversity theme.	A Floral impact assessment has been commissioned and was undertaken in accordance with the National Environmental Management Act: Procedures for assessment and minimum criteria for reporting on identified environmental themes

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							<p>However, where the information gathered from the site or the specialist assessment differs from the designation of very high terrestrial plant species sensitivity from the national web- based environmental screening tool and it is found to be of "low" sensitivity, then a Terrestrial Plant Species Impact Assessment is not required.</p>	<p>A site environmental screening undertaken by the EAP on several occasions found that majority of the site has been disturbed, consist of low laying grass and short shrubs with no evidence of faunal species and per the numerous site photographs within this report. As a result, only a Flora assessment was undertaken</p>
							<p>Should paragraph (2) apply, then a Terrestrial Plant Species Compliance Statement must be submitted. An environmental assessment practitioner or a suitably qualified, taxon relevant specialist, registered with the SACNASP must append to the Terrestrial Plant Species Compliance</p>	<p>Paragraph (2) will not apply as a floral impact assessment has been undertaken for the proposed development.</p>

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							Statement a motivation and evidence (e.g., photographs) of the different Terrestrial Plant Species sensitivity.	
							An outline scheme report which will include existing and proposed infrastructure services as well as a stormwater management plan must be included. The stormwater management plan must be in line with the Stormwater Management by-law.	The outline scheme report has been attached as Appendix G1 where section 6 of this report details the stormwater management plan
							A Traffic Impact Study needs to be conducted to estimate site-generated traffic and assess its impact on the public street system and the ultimate development i.e., taxi rank, shopping centre etc.	A traffic impact assessment was undertaken and the report is appended as Appendix F.
							All relevant stakeholders including (SAHRA and Local Authority CoJ etc.) must be	The mentioned stakeholders have been provided with a copy of the Draft EIR and will be

NO	TITLE	NAME	SURNAME	ORGANISATION /COMMUNITY	DATE OF RECEIPT OF COMMENT	COMMUNICATI ON METHOD	COMMENT	RESPONSE
							consulted during the EIA process and their comments and responses must be included on the draft and final Environmental Impact Assessment Report.	consulted for comments prior to the submission of the Final EIR.
							A detailed project and site-specific Environmental Management Plan (EMP) incorporating the findings and mitigation measures of the specialised studies to be undertaken must be included in both draft and final EIAR.	A site-specific environmental management plan has been compiled and attached as Appendix H.

3 SUMMARY COMMENTS AND CONCLUSION

The comments captured in this report were obtained during the Notification Phase and the review of the Draft Scoping Report. It was noted that the majority of comments received mainly fell under certain categories and not others.

Regarding the characteristics of the proposed development, some community members felt that the Ennerdale site would best suited for a retail centre as this would provide the residents with better employment opportunities. While another raised concerns over the lack of health facilities to provide health care for the anticipated development.

With regards to engineering services, a comment on the existing water shortages in the area was noted. This will aid the engineers in addressing the bulk water services for the proposed development as well as surrounding areas.

In general and while based only on the comments received thus far, the community are not objecting to the proposed development, rather have suggestions such the inclusion of a retail centre, businesses and the upgrade of the Ennerdale Ext. 9 Community Clinic as well as the insight to the beneficiary process and employment opportunities. It is anticipated that additional comments on the above-mentioned as well as other issues will be obtained subsequent to the issuing of the Draft Environmental Impact Assessment Report for review.